President.—Have you asked the purport of all these?

Dr. A. G. Menon.—If the question is answered properly, we will have no cause of complaint, and we will not have the necessity of putting so many supplementary questions.

President.—You may say it is not properly answered. It is a matter of difference of opinion.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Certain technical words are introduced in the answers. That is my difficulty. Such as "competent to make", "sufficient reasons", and "recorded".

President.—One Member will bring in a complaint that the answers are full of mistakes. Another, they are evasive; and so on.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—I do not deny that.

President.—We are asked so many questions. And the Members say that interpellations are not taken in earnest, answers are evasive, and the Legislative Council is converted into a debating society, and there is no reason for having a Legislative Council at all for this State. My chief attention was drawn to such matters as, that once the Diwan promised, at least Diwan President answered, that steps will be taken, after which questions are put to understand what steps Government has taken. In the answer it is given that it is recorded. I do not know in what light it should be taken.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—That is the difficulty with me also.

139. **Dr. A. G. Menon.**—Will the Government be pleased to state:—

(a) whether the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer has issued a general circular to all the institutions under him to the effect that the Visitors' books should not be shown to Dr. A. R. Menon;

(b) if so, was the Government consulted in the matter;

(c) if not, what action does the Government propose to take in the matter?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—(a) Yes; a confidential circular, to have effect "until further orders".

(b) No.

(c) Vide answer to question No. 138. (3).

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Sir, it is said "until further orders" in the answer. Has not that circular been cancelled now?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—It is not cancelled.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—From question (b) it is seen that the Government was not consulted, and for the next question "what action does the Government propose to take in the matter", the answer given is "the matter was considered and recorded."

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Though the Government were not consulted, the matter was considered and recorded.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The Government had made the necessary enquiries into the matter, and this is the action they have taken and that is that it is recorded.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—I could not follow the Member.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The Government made the necessary enquiries as to the circumstances under which that circular was issued, and considered the matter, and this is the result of their conclusion—"recorded."

Dr. A. G. Menon.—In the answer it is stated, "until further orders." Has it been withdrawn, Sir ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No, Sir.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—How long are the Government going to retain that in force ?

President.—You say, "until further orders". When is this "further order" to come ? There must be finality in matters.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—If he moves the Government in the matter by putting in a petition that the circular may be cancelled, and if the Government considers his request favourably, then further orders will be issued. I have not received anything from him.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Are we to go and request the Head of the Departmert for the cancellation of such an order which, we thought, is most undignified ?

President.—That is a comment on the answer.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—The Member says that Government will consider, if he comes and requests for cancellation—of course, as the Member put it, not to him, but the Government. If that is not a comment, my remark was not a comment. My question is "how long will it take for the Government to see that that order is cancelled ? That is the question.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Government have not received any communication to have it cancelled.

President.—Suppose Dr. A. R. Menon does not move in the matter ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The matter will remain as it is.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—So the remarks of the other Members also will meet the same fate, if they were to make any remarks in the Visitors' books.

President.—That is a comment.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Was he informed that he should apply to the Government for the cancellation of it ? Did the Government direct the Member to put in an application ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dr. A. G. Menon.—When I requested the Government to place that correspondence on the table, the answer given is "confidential". How can we know that the Government had an idea that the man who made the remark should put in an application for cancellation of that order? If the correspondence is published, we will be in a position to understand. But now we are kept in the dark "until further orders".

President.—You make observations on the answer given. We can furnish information which is within our knowledge and nothing more.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—In the letter communicated to Dr. A. R. Menon, it is not stated "until further orders." If it is stated so, he would have taken action. Then, why was that portion not communicated to him—I mean the whole order?

President.—We did not want to inform Dr. A. R. Menon that the circular is to have force until further orders.

Dr A. G. Menon.—Appendix II is the copy of the communication sent to Dr. A. R. Menon. Why was not "until further orders" inserted in that?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—There was no necessity to insert that order.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—If so, there is hardly any necessity for applying for the cancellation, Sir. The Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer makes certain remarks, and naturally some comments follow.

President.—He is making a general comment. Of course, in questions like these, we will not be legitimate in offering comments upon the answers or questions. What is wanted is simply information. With that, we have to stop. May be that the information is open to comment, and a lot of things might be made reasonable. That is not our concern at this stage.

140. Dr. A. G. Menon.—Will the Government be pleased to place on the table:—

(1) the remarks of Dr. A R. Menon in the Visitors' book at Kuriarkutti;

(2) the communication of Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer to the Sub-Assistant Surgeon at Kuriarkutti ordering him to expunge the remarks;

(3) the copy of the general circular to his subordinates ordering them not to show the Visitors' books to Dr. A. R. Menon;

(4) all the correspondence that has been passed between the Government and the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer in connection with the above incident?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—(1) and (2). Copies are appended. (*Vide Appendix I.*)

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly